

---

## MINUTES

Meeting:	<b>Planning Committee</b>
Date:	Friday 10 July 2015 at 10.00 am
Venue:	Board Room, Aldern House, Baslow Road, Bakewell
Chair:	Mr P Ancell
Present:	Cllr D Birkinshaw, Cllr P Brady, Cllr C Carr, Cllr Mrs N Hawkins, Mr R Helliwell, Cllr H Laws, Ms S McGuire, Cllr Mrs K Potter and Cllr Mrs J A Twigg Cllr Mrs C Howe in attendance as an observer only Cllr Mrs L Roberts in attendance
Apologies for absence:	Cllr D Chapman, Cllr J Macrae and Cllr G Weatherall

### **76/15 CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The Chair welcomed new Member Cllr Mrs Caroline Howe, who was present to observe the meeting and Mr R Helliwell, attending his first planning committee for the Authority, having previously been a member of the Audit, Resources and Performance Committee. The Chair also noted that Cllr Mrs L Roberts was in attendance to take part in the debates but not to move any recommendations or vote on any agenda items.

### **77/15 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

The minutes of the meeting of 12 June 2015 were approved as a correct record.

The Chair noted that Item 13 had been withdrawn from the agenda following the withdrawal of the Parish Council's objections to the proposals. The application would be determined under delegated powers.

### **78/15 URGENT BUSINESS**

There was no urgent business to report.

### **79/15 MEMBERS DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Item 9:

Cllr P Brady declared that he had a slight acquaintance with Mr A Sebire, who had sent him an email in objection to the proposals.

Cllr Mrs J Twigg had received 2 emails relating to this item.

Mr P Ancell had been contacted by Mr A Sebire re general landscaping considerations.

Item 10:

The Chair noted that prior to the last meeting on 12 June, from which this item had been deferred, most Members had received correspondence from an Agent. Members had received no further correspondence since that time.

Mr P Ancell had been contacted by Ms S Jones and had been copied in on correspondence from the Agent.

Item 12:

Cllr Mrs K Potter had received a letter from Dr P Owens.

Cllr Mrs N Hawkins had received a letter from Dr P Owens.

Cllr P Brady declared a personal interest because the applicant uses his fields for grazing sheep. He would not take part in the debate or voting on this item.

Mrs S McGuire had received a letter and attachments from Dr P Owens.

Item 14:

Cllr H Laws had received an email from Mr A Sebire

Officers Declarations of Interests

Item 6:

John Scott, Director of Planning declared a personal interest in this item as he had previously worked as a planning consultant for the applicant.

## **80/15 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

Ten members of the public were present to make representations to the Committee.

## **81/15 FULL APPLICATION - CONSTRUCTION OF HORSE EXERCISE ARENA AT LAND IMMEDIATELY ADJACENT TO FORD HOUSE, FORD, CHAPEL-EN-LE-FRITH**

The Chair brought the item forward to the beginning of the agenda as it had been delayed in being heard at the June meeting.

The Director of Planning reported that following deferral for a site visit at the last meeting, Members had visited the site the previous day. He confirmed that the proposed use was solely private and not commercial.

The following spoke under the Authority's Public Participation Scheme:

- Mr D Purdon, Objector
- Mr N Marriott, Agent

Following Member debate and questions, amendments to the recommendation were proposed:

Condition 2 – include explicit details of arboricultural methodology

Condition 3 – further detail to be added re landscaping of the south-west embankment to include additional planting

Condition 6 – amend the wording to say “no horse jumps, field shelters or other structures shall be placed on the application site, other than when the exercise area is in use. When not in use, they shall be removed and stored in a location to be agreed.”

Additional Condition 8 – That samples of surface materials be submitted for assessment of their appearance and drainage capabilities, prior to use at the site.

The recommendation as amended was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

**RESOLVED:**

**That the application is APPROVED subject to the following conditions:**

- 1. Statutory three year time limit for implementation.**
- 2. Development to be carried out in accordance with specified approved plans and arboriculture survey. Specific details of the arboricultural methodology to be included.**
- 3. Landscaping to be carried out in complete accordance with the approved plans within the first planting season following completion of the development, further detail to be submitted re landscaping of the south-west embankment to include additional planting**
- 4. The use of the manège hereby permitted shall be ancillary to the domestic use of the dwelling known as “Ford House” only. The manège shall not otherwise be used for commercial purposes or livery at any time.**
- 5. The new timber fencing and kickboards shall be tanalised and left untreated to weather naturally and maintained as such throughout the lifetime of the development hereby approved.**
- 6. Notwithstanding the provisions of the General Permitted Development Order 2015 (or any order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification), no horse jumps, field shelters or other structures shall be placed on the application site, other than when the exercise area is in use. When not in use, they shall be removed and stored in a location to be agreed.**
- 7. There shall be no external lighting or floodlighting erected, and the manège shall not be provided with any other external source of illumination at any time.**
- 8. Samples of surface materials shall be submitted for assessment of their appearance and drainage capabilities, prior to use at the site.**

**82/15 FULL APPLICATION - SINGLE EARTH-SHELTERED DWELLING ON DERELICT LAND TO THE WEST OF YOULGRAVE (AMENDMENTS TO APPROVED PLANS), THE CHASE, COLDWELL END, YOULGRAVE**

The Director of Planning left the meeting room and took no part in the discussions following his declaration of interest in this item.

The planning officer reported that these proposals were essentially the same as the application that Members had previously approved but with a modified design which resulted in a reduction of size and scale. Officers considered that the new design had greater merit than the previous and included good sustainability features.

Since September 2014, work had begun to exclude slow worms from the site by means of a fence. The new proposals would move the house further away from the applicant's neighbour. The officer noted that the site still needed tidying.

The following spoke under the Authority's Public Participation Scheme:

- Mr R Roper, Objector
- Mr D Frederickson, Supporter
- Mr A Baker, Applicant

The recommendation was moved and seconded.

Following further questions from Members, officers agreed to submit a report to the planning committee explaining the Authority's policy on the imposition of Tree Preservation Orders (TPOs). This would be expedited by the Director of Planning and consideration would be also be given to possible input into Members' planning training by the Authority's Tree Officers.

The recommendation was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

**RESOLVED:**

**That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions/modifications:**

**Statutory Time Limit**

1. **The development hereby permitted shall be commenced within three years of the date of the permission.**

**Approved Plans**

2. **The development shall not be carried out otherwise in complete accordance with the submitted plans and specifications subject to the following conditions:**

**Submission of Details**

3. **Submit and agree any details of spoil removal arising from the demolition and construction works.**
4. **Submit and agree Construction Working Method (including working hours) and Ecological mitigation Statement.**
5. **Submit and agree details of the construction site compound.**

6. **No development approved by this permission shall be commenced until a scheme for the package sewage treatment plant and for the disposal of surface waters has been submitted to and approved by the Authority. Such a scheme shall be constructed and completed in accordance with the approved plans, prior to the occupation of the dwelling hereby permitted.**
7. **No development shall take place until a revised scheme of landscaping has been submitted to and agreed in writing by the National Park Authority. The submitted scheme shall include: (i) details of all trees to be retained and protection for those trees during the construction phase of the proposed development; (ii) precise details of all hard and soft landscaping including details of any seeding or planting, surfacing materials and boundary treatments; (iii) precise details of the provision and undergrounding of services; Thereafter, the proposed development shall be carried out in complete accordance with the approved landscaping scheme, which shall be completed prior to the first occupation of the dwelling hereby permitted.**
8. **No works shall commence on the erection of the newly-built dwelling hereby permitted until samples of the materials to be used in the construction of the external surfaces of the dwelling, including samples of the stone, quoins, sills, lintels, and surrounds to be used in the construction of the external walls, samples of all roof coverings and rain water goods, and samples of all external door and window frames and external finish treatments, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the National Park Authority. Thereafter, the development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.**
9. **Details of the scheme of Environmental Management Measures shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the authority. The agreed Environmental management facilities shall then be installed in accordance with a timetable that has been submitted to and approved in writing by the authority.**
10. **Submit and agree details of external lighting.**

#### **Service Lines**

11. **All new service lines associated with the approved development and on land within the applicant's ownership and control, shall be placed underground and the ground restored to its original condition thereafter.**

#### **Architectural Specifications**

12. **Conditions relating to design details including specifications for construction materials, windows and doors, etc.**

#### **Restrictions on Permitted Development Rights**

13. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (or any order revoking, re-enacting or modifying that Order), no ancillary outbuildings or other structures incidental to the enjoyment of the dwelling other than those expressly authorised by this permission shall be erected.
14. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (or any order revoking, re-enacting or modifying that Order), no extensions or alterations to the newly-built dwelling shall be carried out.
15. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (or any order revoking, re-enacting or modifying that Order), no windows or doors other than those expressly authorised by this permission shall be constructed on any elevation.
16. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (or any order revoking, re-enacting or modifying that Order), no walls, fences, or solar panels other than those expressly authorised by this permission shall be erected or installed on the site.

#### **Access and Parking**

17. Access entrance, visibility splays, access drive and vehicle parking areas to be carried out in accordance with the amended plan no. AR/XX/01/PD/332/01 Rev A prior to the occupation of the dwelling.
18. Visibility splays and parking/manoeuvring areas (including the car-port) to remain free from obstruction to their intended use.

#### **Curtilage**

19. The domestic curtilage shall be restricted to the are edged green on the attached plan no. 1/P.4221

A short break was taken between 11.09 and 11.16am.

As Item 7 had no speakers, the Chair brought Item 8 forward.

### **83/15 FULL APPLICATION - CHANGE OF USE OF BARN TO AGRICULTURAL WORKER'S DWELLING AT NEW BUILDING, VICARAGE FARM, HOLLINSCLOUGH**

Members had visited the site on the previous day.

The officer stated that accommodation for the applicant's son was needed but that there were buildings nearer to the farmhouse that would better meet this need.

The following spoke under the Authority's Public Participation Scheme:

- Cllr Mrs G Heath, Authority Member, in support as the applicant's district and county councillor.

Following debate, Members were minded to approve the application on the basis that the buildings nearer to the farmhouse were not suitable for conversion, for reasons that had been apparent during the site visit. They were already in use for farm purposes which would have to be relocated as a consequence of conversion into a dwelling. Members also perceived no harm to the landscape arising out of the barn conversion and were satisfied that the use of the proposed dwelling and its domestic paraphernalia could be controlled by conditions and a legal agreement.

The Director of Planning advised that Standing Order 1.48 applied and that whilst the proposal to approve did not constitute a departure from policy, it was contrary to the officer recommendation, and a final decision should be deferred to the following meeting so that a section 106 legal agreement and detailed conditions could be brought back to Committee with a recommendation for approval.

**RESOLVED:**

**That under the Authority's Standing Order no. 1.48, a further report setting out conditions and the terms of a legal agreement shall be brought to the next meeting of the planning committee for final determination with a recommendation for approval.**

**84/15 FULL APPLICATION: PROPOSED CHANGE OF USE OF REDUNDANT BARN TO DWELLING, INCLUDING REMOVAL OF LEAN-TO EXTENSION AND REPLACEMENT WITH 2-STOREY PITCHED ROOF EXTENSION, FROST BARN, SYCAMORE FARM, FAWFIELDHEAD, LONGNOR**

Members had visited the site on the previous day.

The officer reported that although in officers' opinion Frost Barn met the planning criteria for conversion into an open market dwelling, the Core Strategy allowed for in principle conversions of such valued vernacular buildings only where there would be no harm either to the building or to its landscape setting.

On balance, Members felt that the proposals would have an adverse effect on the landscape and therefore could not be justified. A motion to refuse the application was moved and seconded on the basis of landscape impact and the poor structural state of the barn.

**RESOLVED:**

**That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:**

- 1. The barn occupies a prominent and exposed position in a landscape of exceptional value that should be safeguarded because of its intrinsic scenic beauty. The current proposals would fail to meet/achieve this objective and the proposed residential conversion of the barn would spoil the character and setting of the barn and would not achieve its conservation or enhancement by virtue of the significant amount of rebuilding required for its conversion and by virtue of the introduction of a domestic use and associated developments in this sensitive location. The proposals would therefore be contrary to Core Strategy policies GSP1, GSP2, GSP3, L1 and L3, saved Local Plan policies LC4 and LC8, and national planning policies in the Framework.**
- 2. In this case, by virtue of its remote and isolated location in open countryside and by virtue of the harmful impacts associated with the barn conversion, the**

benefits of granting planning permission for the development proposals would be significantly and demonstrably outweighed by the adverse impacts of doing so. Therefore, the proposals are contrary to the principles of sustainable development set out in Core Strategy policy GSP1 and national planning policies in the Framework.

**85/15 SECTION 73 APPLICATION - VARIATION OF CONDITIONS 7, 8, 10, 12 AND 14 ON NP/SM/0711/0677 TO INCREASE THE NUMBER OF TOTAL CARAVAN AND TENT PITCHES, EXTEND THE SEASON BY 2 MONTHS AND ALLOW FOR A WARDEN'S PITCH FOR 10 MONTHS, UPPER HURST FARM, HULME END, ALSTONEFIELD**

Members had visited the site the previous day.

The officer summarised the content of a further letter of objection that had been received.

The following spoke under the Authority's Public Participation Scheme:

- Miss S Green, Applicant

The recommendation for approval was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

**RESOLVED:**

**That the application be APPROVED, subject to the following conditions:**

**Approved Plans**

1. The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out otherwise than in complete accordance with the submitted plan no's 020/05 (Campsite Layout Plan), 020/01,02,03&04 (Landscaping Specifications), subject to the following conditions or modifications:

**Landscaping**

2. Any trees or plants which form part of the existing perimeter hedge/tree planting which die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased within five years of the date of this permission shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of a similar size and species or in accordance with an alternative scheme previously agreed in writing by the National Park Authority.

**Limitations on Use of Site**

3. The proposed use of the site for touring caravans shall not take place other than within the area annotated as caravan pitches numbered C1 - C25 on the submitted plans and no other part of the land at Upper Hurst Farm within the applicant's ownership shall be used to site caravans.
4. The total number of caravans on the site at any one time shall not exceed 25.



5. No caravans shall be placed or retained anywhere on land within the applicant's ownership or control between 31st November in any one year and the 1st of February in the succeeding year.
6. Other than mobile recreational vehicles, no caravan or structure shall be placed anywhere within the red-edged application site which is not capable of being towed on a public highway by a private family car.
7. The warden's caravan shall not be occupied as a permanent residence and shall be removed from the site on or before 31st November in any one year and shall not be returned to its designated pitch hereby permitted until the 1st of February in the succeeding year.
8. No caravans on the annotated caravan pitches numbered 1-25 shall be occupied as a permanent or sole place of residence by any person at any time during the lifetime of the development hereby permitted.
8. The proposed use of the site for camping/siting of tents shall not take place other than within the areas numbered T1 – T15 on the submitted plans and no other part of the land at Upper Hurst Farm within the applicant's ownership shall be used to site tents/camping.
9. No tents shall be sited, placed or retained anywhere on land in the applicant's ownership between 31st November in any one year and the 1st of February in the succeeding year.
10. The total number of tents and caravans on the site at any one time shall not exceed 40.

#### **Restrictions on Permitted Development Rights**

11. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning General Permitted Development Order 2015 (or any order revoking or re-enacting that Order) no alterations to the external appearance of the utility building shall be carried out without the National Park Authority's prior written consent.
12. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning General Permitted Development Order 2015 (or any order revoking or re-enacting that Order) no development required by the conditions of a site licence for the time being in force under the 1960 Act shall be carried out or erected on the site without the National Park Authority's prior written consent.

#### **Access**

13. The existing access from Beresford Lane to the camping and caravanning site at Upper Hurst Farm shall be maintained free of any obstruction to its designated use throughout the lifetime of the development hereby permitted.

Members had viewed the site on the previous day.

This application was deferred at the January 2015 Planning Committee to allow for the consideration of alternative uses for the barn. The agent submitted additional information and amended plans in June which had been incorporated into the report.

The following spoke under the Authority's Public Participation Scheme:

- Dr P Owens, Objector
- Mr J Oldfield, Agent

Following debate, Members moved and seconded another deferral for the purpose of obtaining more information about the structural condition of the barn by means of an independent survey. More information was also required about the likely costs of conversion, the possible alternative uses for the barn and about the surrounding strip field pattern.

As the seconder of the motion had Cllr Mrs K Potter left the room briefly during the discussion, another Member seconded it in her place. Cllr Mrs Potter did not vote on the proposals.

The committee voted to continue beyond 3 hours, in accordance with Standing Orders.

The motion for deferral was then voted upon and carried.

**RESOLVED:**

**That the item be DEFERRED for the provision of further information about the structural condition of the building in order to determine its need for conversion.**

**87/15 RETROSPECTIVE APPLICATION FOR THE REPLACEMENT OF AN AGRICULTURAL BUILDING - LAND ADJACENT TO CORNERWAYS, CURBAR LANE, CURBAR**

The officer reported that an agricultural appraisal had been submitted as requested by Members when the last application had been refused by the Planning Committee in September 2014.

The following spoke under the Authority's Public Participation Scheme:

- Dr P Owens, Objector
- Cllr D Nicholson, Chair of Curbar Parish Council, Objector
- Mr J Oldfield, Agent

A motion for refusal was moved and seconded on the basis of landscape impact, but fell when put to the vote. The recommendation for approval was then moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

**RESOLVED:**

**That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:**

1. **The building shall only be used for agriculture on the holding and shall be removed from the site when no longer required for the purposes of agriculture.**

The committee broke for lunch at 1.35pm and reconvened at 2pm.

Cllr C Carr left the meeting during the lunch break.

Chair: Mr P Ancell

Present: Cllr D Birkinshaw, Cllr P Brady, Cllr Mrs N Hawkins, Mr R Helliwell,  
Cllr Mrs C Howe, Cllr H Laws, Ms S McGuire, Cllr Mrs K Potter, Cllr Mrs J Twigg

Also in attendance: Cllr Mrs L Roberts

### **88/15 MONITORING & ENFORCEMENT QUARTERLY REVIEW - JULY 2015**

The Chair noted the new format of the quarterly report and invited feedback from Members.

The officer explained that his intention was to provide a shorter, simpler report focusing on the last quarter, hence the reduction of historical statistics as formerly shown in bar chart form. Fuller statistical information would appear in an Annual Monitoring and Enforcement Report in April each year. Members requested that the Annual Report includes some information on the time taken to resolve cases.

The pie chart on page 5 of the report was insufficiently clear so the officer interpreted it for Members, showing that the greatest portion of cases were now classed as Stage 1 and the smallest portion as Stage 3 – the meaning of the different stages appeared at the bottom of page 4 of the report.

Members observed that although former “High Priority” cases would no longer appear in the quarterly report and instead “High Profile” cases were included, the two were not mutually exclusive. The shortened summary was welcomed.

The officer stressed that although four of the former ‘High Priority’ cases would no longer appear in the report the cases would not be closed and officers would continue to seek a resolution.

The recommendation was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

**RESOLVED:**

**That the report be noted.**

Cllr Mrs N Hawkins, Cllr Mrs K Potter and Cllr P Brady left the meeting.

### **89/15 HEAD OF LAW - PLANNING APPEALS**

The recommendation was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

**RESOLVED:**

**That the report be received.**

The meeting ended at 3.45 pm